

CENTRE FOR POLITICAL STUDIES
SCHOOL OF SOCIAL SCIENCES
JAWAHARLAL NEHRU UNIVERSITY
WINTER SEMESTER 2021

M.A. OPTIONAL COURSE: PO 544

COURSE TITLE: RECOGNITION, REDISTRIBUTION, REPRESENTATION

INSTRUCTOR: DR AJAY GUDAVARTHY

Credits 4

Scheme of Evaluation: A mid-semester exam (25%), tutorial assignment (25%) and an end-semester examination (50%)

Objective of the course

The objective of the course is to introduce students to the current debates in Critical Theory on the modes of ways of reconciling and integrating claims for recognition with that of redistribution and representation; and further interrogate these theoretical propositions from the vantage point of ongoing debates and patterns through which both social movement and state policy have been demonstrating the propensity to move towards ‘trivalent approach’ towards social processes. The Contemporary Critical Theory is marked by overcoming dichotomies and binaries, and yet maintaining analytical distinction between the economic, political and the cultural process, based on the ‘dialectics of reconciliation’. In order to realize such dialectics it has inaugurated new combinatory formulation between materialist analysis that foregrounds the structures and totality, and post structuralism, discourse analysis and cultural studies. The current course would introduce students these theoretical categories through reading of series of texts that lay out the formulations, with special focus on the writings of Nancy Fraser, and her continued dialogue with Axel Honneth, Judith Butler, Richard Rorty, Iris Marion Young, Renner Forest, and Anne Phillips. The central theme marking the strong links between the various exchanges would be the overarching (common) concern of various thinkers to comprehend the emergent interface between recognition, redistribution and representation.

The other part of the course focuses on taking representative cases in India from contemporary political movements and state policy, around each of the axis to explore the specific mode in which integration has been made possible. In India group benefits are often linked to various identities, which belies false dichotomy between classes' verses other purportedly, post material politics of recognition. Similarly, state policy such as reservations is based on the premise that recognition of group distinction is necessary to subvert these distinctions. State initiated classification has been the basis of not only representation but also to augment redistribution within recognition.

RECOGNITION

Sub-theme A: Recognition beyond identity.

Readings

1. Nancy Fraser, From Redistribution To Recognition? Dilemmas of Justice in a Postsocialist Age *New Left Review*, 212, 1995
2. Axel Honneth, Recognition Or Redistribution? Changing Perspectives on The Moral Order, *Society; Theory, Culture And Society*. 18(2-3), 2001
3. Nancy Fraser, Rethinking Recognition, *New Left Review*, May-June,2000
4. Judith Butler, Merely Cultural, *New Left Review*, 227 January/ February, 1998
5. Nancy Fraser, Hetero-sexism, Misrecognition And Capitalism; A Response to Judith Butler, *New Left Review*, 228, 1998
6. Iris Marion Young, Unruly Categories: A Critique of Nancy Fraser's Dual System Theory, *New Left Review*, 222, March/April, 1997
7. Nancy Fraser, A Rejoinder To Iris Young, *New Left Review*, 2-3, May/June 1997
8. Richard Rorty, Is Cultural Recognition A Useful Concept For Leftist Policies, *Critical Horizon*, Vol.1. Feb 2000
9. Nancy Fraser, Why Overcoming Prejudice Is Not Enough: A Rejoinder To Richard Rorty, *Critical Horizon*, Vol.1.NO.1, Feb 2000
10. Majid Yar, Beyond Nancy Fraser's 'Perspectival Dualism' *Economy and Society*, 30(3), Aug 2001
11. Majid Yar, Recognition and The Politics Human(e) Desire, *Theory Culture And Society*, 18, 2001

Supplementary Readings:

1. Nancy Fraser, False Anti-Thesis: Response to Seyla Benhabib and Judith Butler, *Praxis International*, 11(2),1991.
2. Bikhu Prekh, Retyristribution or Recognition? A Misguided Debate in Stephen may et.al ed, *Ethnicity, Nitionalism and Minority Rights*, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge,1994
3. Nancy Fraser, Recognition or Redistribution, A Critical Readings of Iris Young's Justice And Politics of Difference, *Journal of Political Philosophy*, 3,2,1995
4. Christopher Zurn, Identity or Status? Struggles over Recognition in Fraser, Honneth and Taylor *Constellations*, Vol 10,no.4, 2003.

Sub-theme B: Politics of recognition in India

Readings

1. Dipesh Chakrabarty History and the politics of recognition in India in K.Jenkins edition manifestos for History, Routledge, London,2007.
2. Sanjay Ruparelia, How the Politics of Recognition enabled India's Democratic Exceptionalism in *International Journal of Politics Culture and Society*, vol, 21 No. 1-4, December 2018
3. Dilip Menon, Why Communalism in India is About Caste in *The Blindness of Insight: Essays on Caste in Modern India*, Tulika, Delhi, 2006
4. Ornit Shani, *Communalism Caste and Hindu Nationalism the Violence in Gujarat*, Cambridge University Press Cambridge, 2007
5. Anand Teltumbde, (ed) *Hindutva and Dalits*, Samya, Calcutta, 2006
6. Chinna Rao (ed) *Dividing Dalits*, Rawat, Jaipur, 2009
7. Anand Teltumbde, Reservations within Reservations, *Economic and Political Weekly*, October, 10 2009
8. Sukhdev Thorat, and Umakant, (ed) *Caste,Race and Discrimination*, Rawat, Jaipur, 2004
9. Gopal Guru, (ed) *Humiliation* Oxford University Press, Delhi, 2009
10. Sundar Sarrukai, Dalit Experience and Theory *Economic and Political Weekly*, October, 6, 2007

Supplementary Readings:

1. Gurpreet Mahajan, *Identities and Rights*, Oxford University Press, Delhi, 2000
2. Neera Chandhoke, *Individual and Group Rights: A View from India* in Zoya Hasan (ed) *India's Living Constitution: Ideas, Practices and Controversies*, Anthem Press London, 2005
3. Marc Galanter, *Competing Equalities: Law and Backward Classes in India*, Oxford University Press, Delhi, 1991
4. Laura Dudley Jenkin's, *Identity and Identification in India: Defining the Disadvantaged* Routledge, London, 2003
5. Anand Teltumbde, *Race or Caste, Discrimination is a Universal Concern*, Economic and Political Weekly, June 20 2009

REDISTRIBUTION

Sub-theme A: Redistribution and Class

Readings:

1. Stuart Hall, *the Political and Economic in marx's theory of classes* in Helen Hunt (ed) *Class and Class Structure*, Lawrence and Newhart Limited, London, 1977
2. Em Wood, *Separation of the Economic and the political*, in *Capitalism: New Left Review*, 1/27 1981
3. Andrew Sales, *The Moral Significance of Class*: Cambridge University, Press, Cambridge, 2005
4. Iris Marion Young, *Structural Injustice and The Politics of Difference* in Emily Grabon, M Ravana Cooper ,Jain Krishna Das Didi Herman (ed) *Intersectionality and Beyond Low Power and Politics of Location*, Routledge, 2008 4
5. Reena Frost, *First Things First* *European Journal of Political Theory*, Vol, 6, no. 3, 2007
6. James Bowman, *Beyond Distributive Justice and Struggle for Recognition*, *Freedom, Democracy and Critical Theory: European journal of Political Theory*, Vol 6, no.3 2007
7. Ingrid Ruben's, *Is Nancy Phrases Critique of Theories of Distributive Justice justified?* *Constellations*, 10 no. 4 2003

8. Kevin Olson, Distributive Justice and Politics of Difference *Critical Horizons*, no. 1, 2001\

Supplementary Readings:

1. Nancy Fraser, *Struggles Over Needs Outline of A Socialist Feminist Critical Theory of Late Capitalist Political Culture in Unruly Practices: Power Discourse and Gender in Contemporary Social Theory*, Minnesota press, 1989
2. Nancy Fraser, *Institutionalizing emocratic, Justice, Redistribution, Recognition and Participation in Frazer and Benhabib, (ed) Pragmatism, Critique and Judgement*, MIT 2004
3. E.M. Wood, *Falling Through the Cracks: E.P.Thompson and The Debate on Base and Superstructure in H.J.Kaye and K McCelland (ed), EP Thompson: Critical Perspectives*, Philadelphia, 1992
4. E.O.Wright, *Rethinking Once Again: The Concept of Class Structure in Reworking Class* edited by John Hall, Cornell University Press, 1997
5. Pierre Bourdieu, *Distinction: A Social Critique of The Judgement of Taste* London, Routledge, 1984
6. Special Issue on Redistribution in *Critical Theory*, *European Journal of Political Theory*, volume 6, no. 3 2007, Essay by Linda Martin Alcoff, James Bohman and Others with a reply by Nancy Fraser.

Sub theme B: Distributive Politics in India

1. Manoranjan Mohanty ed *Caste Class and Gender*, Sage, Delhi 2000.
2. Pranab Bardhan, *Democracy and Distributive Politics in India* Online: [http://globetrotter, Berkeley.edu](http://globetrotter.berkeley.edu)
3. Atul Kohli, *Politics and Redistribution in India*, Online: [http:// www.princeton.edu/kohli](http://www.princeton.edu/kohli)
4. John Harris, *Do Political Regimes Matter:Poverty, Reduction and Regime, difference Across India in Peter Hutzager and Mick Moore ed Changing Paths: International Development and The New Politics of Inclusion*, University of Michigan press, USA, 2003.
5. K.C.Suri, *Democracy, Economic Reforms and Election Results in India*, *Economic and Political Weekly* no.39(51) Dec 18-24, 2004
6. Shrin Rai, *Deliberative Democracy and Politics of Redistribution the Case of the Indian Panchayats*, *Hypatia*, November 2007

7. Bina Agarwal, Why Do Women Need Independent Rights in Land? Mary John edited Women's Studies in India: A Reader, Penguin, Delhi 2008
8. Surendre Mohan, The Creamy Layer, Mainstream 24 April 2017

Supplementary Readings:

1. The Mandal Case, Indira Sahani versus Union of India, 1992, Supplementary 3 ssc 217
2. The Mandal Commission Report of The Backward Classes Commission 5
3. Mitu Sengupta, Politics of India's Market Reforms, Economic and Political Weekly, may 30, 2008
4. P.S. Appu, Land Reforms in India, Vikas Publishers, Delhi 1996
5. Partha Chatterjee, Politics of the Governed, Permanent Black, Delhi 2004

REPRESENTATION

Sub theme A: Representation and The Specificity of the Political

1. Leonardo C Feldman, Redistribution, Recognition and the State: The Irreducible Political Dimension of Injustice Political Theory volume 30 number 3 June 2002
2. Nancy Fraser, Reframing Justice in A Globalising World, New Left Review, 36, 2005
3. Nancy Frase,r the politics of framing: An Interview with Fraser, Theory, Culture and Society, 24 ,2007.
4. Carol Gould, Recognition in Redistribution: Care and Diversity in Global Justice, The Southern Journal of Philosophy, Vol. XLVI, 2008
5. Annie Philips, The Politics of Presence, Clarendon press, London, 1998
6. George Lawson, A Realistic Utopia? Nancy Fraser, Cosmopolitanism and the Making of a Just World Order, Political studies, Vol. 56, issue 4, 2008

Supplementary Readings:

1. Nancy Fraser, Abnormal Justice, Critical Inquiry, Vol. 34, No.3, 2008
2. Nancy Fraser, Rethinking the Public Sphere :A Contribution to the Critique of Actually Existing Democracy in Craig Calhoun edited Habermas and Public Sphere,MIT press, 1991
3. Nancy Fraser, Adding Insult to Injury: Nancy Fraser Debates Her Critics: Debating Redistribution, Recognition and Representation, Verso Books, 2008

4. David Held and Anthony McGrew (Ed) Global Transformations Reader: An Introduction to the Globalisation Debate, Polity, Second Edition, 2003

Sub theme B: Representation and Democratic Processes in India

Readings:

1. Ravinder Kumar, Gandhi, Ambedkar and the Poona Pact, 1932 in Jim Masselos (ed) Struggling and Ruling the Indian National Congress 1885 _1985, Sterling publishers Delhi 1987
2. Nivedita Menon, The Elusive Woman Feminist and Women's Reservation Bill in Mary John edition
3. Mary John, Alternative Modernities: Reservation and Women's Movement in 20th century India, Economic and Political Weekly, October 28, 2000
4. Madhu Kishwar, Women and Politics: Beyond Quotas, Economic and Political Weekly, September 26, 1996
5. Laura Dudley Jenkins, Competing Inequalities: The Struggle over Reserved Seats for Women in India's Parliament in E. Donis and A. Janseens(ed) Complicating Categories: Gender, Class, Race and Ethnicity, Cambridge University Press ,Cambridge 1999
6. Zoya Hasan, Politics of Inclusion: Caste Minority and Representation in India, Oxford University Press, Delhi, 2009
7. Zoya Hasan, Reservations for Muslims, Seminar, July 2005
8. Theoder Wright, A New Demand for Muslim Reservations in India, Asian Survey, Vol. 37 ,No. 9 September, 1997
9. E Sridharan, Does India Need to Switch to Proportional Representation: The Pros and Cons in Paul father edition Recasting Indian Politics: Essays on Working Democracy, Palgrave, London 2006
10. E Sridharan, Origins of Electoral System: Rules, Representation and Power Sharing in India's Democracy in Zoya Hasan edition

Supplementary Readings:

1. Nivedita Menon, Recovering Subversion, Permanent Black, Delhi 2000
2. Special Issue of Seminar 457, September 1997 (on Women's Reservation Bill)

3. Cutting Across Party Lines: Women Members of Parliament Explain their Stand on Reservation Quota, Manushi, 96, 1996
4. Zoya Hasan, The Politics of Presence and Legislative Reservation for Women in Zoya Hassan edition
5. Sachar Committee Report, Ministry of Minority affairs ([http / / minority affairs. gov.in](http://minorityaffairs.gov.in))
6. Christopher Jaffrelot and Sanjay Kumar (ed) The Rise of The Plebeians, Routledge, Delhi, 2009
7. Nirmala Rao, Representation in Local Politics: A Reconsideration and Some New Evidence, Political Studies Xi(VI), 1998.